

Integrating the Arts: Educational Entrepreneurship in a School Setting



LIORA BRESLER

UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS, URBANA, USA
liora@illinois.edu

ABSTRACT | What qualities make for successful integration of the arts and the so-called core curriculum? Clearly, integration requires more than scheduling changes, and results in substantial learning well beyond drawing snowflakes in science or singing patriotic songs in social studies. This paper presents one case of arts integration in a Texan high school, where the project coordinator was the music teacher. I examine those qualities that made it a successful integration, including the curriculum, the institutional structures, and some of the characteristics and background of the project coordinator. Based on this and other cases of successful integration of the arts into the academic curriculum (and as important, cases where such integration failed despite seemingly promising conditions), I identify some characteristics that are important to arts integration. These characteristics include: (i) going beyond the traditional disciplinary knowledge to creatively reflect ownership and personal commitments; (ii) being able to listen to others and to collaborate in what I refer to as transformative practice zone (TZP); and (iii) perseverance in a process of experiential learning of the innovation. These characteristics, I suggest, constitute educational entrepreneurship, with an emphasis on the social and the intellectual.

Keywords: Arts, integration, curriculum, Educational Entrepreneurship, Context of Schooling.

The Case: Arts Integration into Academic Disciplines

This case is based on a study initiated by the Getty Center and the College Board. I was asked to evaluate the integration of the arts into academic disciplines in five American high schools. Based on a review process of hundreds of proposals, these five schools were selected for their commitment to integration and received some funding by the Getty Institute in support of the integration project. Of these five, Martinez High School in Texas served the most transient population in what is believed to be the poorest county in the United States. The school was located in a mid-size town of approximately 140,000 people with a Latino population of over 80%.

The characteristics of the student body at Martinez High School made it an unconventional setting for the kind of integrated arts and academic learning being tried there. The student population was 99% Hispanic from a low socio-economic community where 94% of the families qualified for some

type of federal assistance. Ninety percent of the student population was identified as at-risk and below grade level in at least one core academic area. English was a second language for most students; for many, time spent at school was the only English-speaking part of their day. Before the study started, the school had the lowest TAKS (Texas Assessment of Knowledge and Skills) scores in the district. The school was on probation with the State Board of Education because less than 40% of its students passed the yearly Texas Assessment of Academic Skills (TAKS) exams, which ultimately determined whether they would graduate or not. When the new school was planned and subsequently opened, there was money allotted for hiring new faculty, including faculty with training and experience in the arts. David Murray, a music teacher with a doctorate in music, was one of those hires.

Data sources. I spent in the school 3 days, with approximately 12 hours of field-work each day. I was joined by Dr. Eve Harwood, a professor of music education and a close colleague who was interested in the project and volunteered her time and superb observational skills. Observations focused on academic classes (mostly English/Social Studies) as well as guitar classes and additional music integrated into English classes. We attended school concerts --Guitar Class Concert and the High School Choir Concert; and a community theater Christmas play, that featured one of the school teachers and students from area schools. We conducted in depth, semi-structured interviews with the principal; the music teacher/coordinator of the program; six teachers of academic disciplines (four participating in the program, one who was scheduled to start next semester, and one who was not yet involved); and all arts teachers. We also conducted informal conversations with students and other teachers.

The Arts Integration Program

The original proposal submitted by the school to the Getty Institute/College Board to qualify for support stated, "The ultimate goal of this proposal is to provide students with a comprehensive exposure to the fine arts while at the same time increasing student achievement, performance, and attendance. We feel integrating the arts into the English and social studies programs will be the catalyst to meet these goals."

Texas state curriculum guidelines require that the ninth grade year focus on World Literature and World Government; that the tenth grade year cover World Literature in English and World History; that American Literature and United States History be covered in eleventh grade; and the British Literature, United States Government and Economics be covered in the twelfth grade. In the year of our study, Martinez was focusing on integrating social studies and English classes with arts and began implementation with students in the 10th grade. Students were grouped into modules of 90 minutes, and literature and social studies teachers were teamed together.

To many, the notion of spending time and energy on providing arts instruction as part of the academic program in such circumstances was outlandish. Even within the school, it was apparent that there were significant worries about the academic performance of the Martinez students on TAKS tests, and even a suggestion that there be a special course on basic skills, more drill and practice, in preparation specifically for the test.

The curriculum. The curriculum was structured around concepts, and themes, rather than the traditional disciplinary organization and contents. There was clear evidence that integration was taking

place, in a manner consistent with the thematic integrity of each unit. The integration style in the three arts subjects (music, visual arts, and drama) revolved around the broad themes of class, gender, ethnicity, family, and propaganda. The following are examples of the integrated curriculum.

Under the theme of Class, students read poetry by Langston Hughes, discussed a blues form, heard blues performed by BB King, and wrote their own blues lyrics. The discussion ranged from discussing rhythm and the mechanics of poetry and music, to providing broader historical and sociological contexts for the Blues. In another unit on Class, students studied the Mexican, French and Russian revolutions in history, heard and sang songs associated with the Mexican revolution, and read literature dealing with class differences, such as *Call No Man Master* and *The Great Gatsby*.

As part of the Gender theme in Drama/English, students discussed the features and context of Greek tragedy, talked about the values and messages in *Antigone* and performed parts of *Antigone* to a select school audience. The curriculum included a visual art unit based on classical Greek art. Students studying the changing role of women during the 20th Century in History, were also studying the portrayal of relations between the sexes in *The Taming of the Shrew*, and examined portrayals of women vs. men in visual art from the "Great Masters" series. As part of a unit on Ethnicity, students read poetry and literature from the Harlem Renaissance, heard and subsequently wrote their own blues lyrics, and studied the role of race in conflicts from the Spanish Civil War through World War II and contemporary topics such as ethnic cleansing. In another unit under the same theme, students studied a drama by Luis Valdez about a pear picker, with the theater teacher, engaging in improvisation and analyzing character stereotypes. Another English/Social Studies team collaborated with the Visual Art teacher to create a unit which involved students' writing and illustrating in visual images the Creation story, including the reading Gilgamesh stories in their English class. In discussions and meta-level questions raised regularly in class, teachers guided students in exploring the nature of music and art and their social and personal meaning.

Music, visual art and drama have been integrated into the curriculum consistently throughout the semester. Once the thematic units were identified, the teams developed a schedule to include visits from arts specialists. In general, the arts specialists -- (music, visual art, or drama) visited each class twice a week, once in English, and once in Social Studies. In addition, some of the teachers brought in CD's of relevant music, pictures, or other art resources from their personal collections to share with students during the regular class periods.

Textbooks and formal materials. Textbooks were relegated to a minimal role. Martinez teachers, like all Texas teachers, were constrained by a state and district curriculum and by the statewide textbook adoption policy, which means that one textbook is supplied throughout the state for each subject and grade level. The particular text for Social Studies was not organized for the curriculum these teachers were implementing, although they were able to use it as a resource. The English anthology provided the teachers with somewhat more flexibility in choosing material for the thematic units. Music resources consisted of music sheets, CD's and historical and musical materials and information including the Internet. In the main, the teachers used a variety of resources materials, including personal items.

The assignments encouraged inquiry skills, exercising the ability to conduct independent research, to create interpretations, and to express personal opinions and views in small and large

groups. In addition to the interpretive, issue-oriented contents, some assignments were aimed at building a factual base, and used quizzes to test retention and knowledge. Other assignments highlighted students' interpretation, creativity and expression. For example, in one observed integrated English/Social Studies/Music session, students were asked to write their own words ("The depressing things in Martinez high school . . ."), and were encouraged to be expressive and critical (criticism directed at the instructional team) within the constraints of the Blues structure.

Students' ownership and initiatives. What was striking in the project was not only the integration across disciplines, but the relevance of the themes and the contents to students' lives. This ownership resulted in students' initiative extending beyond the academic learning to creating conditions for learning. Some students, for example, were disruptive to the class, and the rest decided they did not want to be disrupted, so they divided the room into two diagonal sections. One section housed the disruptive people (or those who are tired and didn't want to learn), and the other housed the motivated ones. There was constant flow between the two sections, when the disruptive students decided they wanted to give the class-work a try, or when the motivated decided they wanted a break. But there were no more disruptions. This type of student-directed activity is an early indication of the evolution of a learning-oriented community and the students' investments in it.

Teachers' collaborations. The large, 90 minutes blocks, facilitated extended planning time, and the regular meetings among teachers encouraged interaction and the development of common curriculum. With one exception, working relations among staff seemed to be excellent, and all teachers reported being expanded in the process of developing curricula together. The fact that the head of the Social Studies department was a key participant, and a strong advocate of the project mission facilitated the process.

There was close continuing collaboration between teachers on the same team. In several instances, one research paper was assigned for evaluation in both classes. The focus on Social Studies was on content of the paper, research sources, and ideas. The focus in English was on editing, proofreading, grammar, thesis development and other aspects of writing.

Impact on learning. In addition to standardized measures such as SAT and TAKS scores, indicators of achievement being monitored by Dr. Murray include student attendance, tardiness and graduation rates. The teachers also reported various anecdotal evidence that students seemed more interested, participated more in class, and seemed to enjoy themselves more. Quite a few students told me that they used to skip school but are now considerably more motivated and invested, since the curriculum addressed issues that are relevant, and incorporated "their music", bridging home and school cultures. While these were important to the teachers, what seemed crucial to the continuation of the program were the TAKS results. From being at the bottom of the district when the project started, the school scores went considerably up, among the highest in the district. The day that test results were published was a day of celebration in the school. The principal, feeling vulnerable in her first year in the school, was relieved, knowing her job will continue. A teacher called on the day the results were published to report about the exuberance, the hugging and kissing in the corridor. The project was validated! One teacher said that seeing the reactions of the students to the integrated curriculum was a strong motivation for him to continue, despite the increased workload.

The Music Teacher as a Key Player

Dr. David Murray served as the project coordinator and was a key person behind the integration. He brought to the project a high level of intellectual curiosity, enthusiasm, people's skills and commitment. Coordinating the project was in addition to his regular duties as the school guitar and Estudiantina teacher. What made his role as coordinator and key person so unusual was the low involvement of music teachers with integration across the four other schools of the project. In general, I have found that even when schools were committed to arts integration, of all school teachers-- arts and academic subjects included-- music teachers were typically the least likely to participate in collaboration (Bresler, 2003).¹

At the high-school level, this could be attributed to the nature of music education in high-schools in the US. Choral and band teachers are enormously concerned about skills and high performance ratings and their position often depends on these ratings. I was told in Texas that if a band director does not bring in a rating "1" for his performing group for three consecutive years, he is likely to be fired. Indeed, in all five schools of arts integration (Bresler, 1997), choral and band teachers were not interested in integrating music into the broader curriculum. I found it interesting that band and choral teachers in Martinez school featured the traditional western, repertoire, even though it was clearly less appealing to the local Spanish population (as indicated in the concert we attended). In contrast, the guitar concerts organized by Dr. Murray seemed highly popular with students, parents, and the wider community.

David Murray, a guitarist and a guitar teacher, was exceptionally open to a variety of styles in performance and had a solid knowledge of sociological trends in music. Part of Murray's ability to integrate music and academics could be attributed, I believe, to the different enculturation and expectations of the traditional USA band/choir ensembles as compared to the guitar ensemble. In guitar, performances are judged as contributing to the local community rather than prizes and awards, which are central to band and choir. Another factor had to do with the teachers' profiles and commitments. Guitar teachers tend to be almost "self-taught" in their education, typically in informal settings, drawing heavily on popular media, and less enculturated into the classical, more rigid traditions and expectations of the band and classical music world. Guitar teachers are often proficient in different musical styles, and modes of playing (e.g., improvisation as well as the classical notation). Teaching band and choir performance is seen to require sophisticated skills which take much time to develop and build. Time away from these skills can be seen as threatening success in competitions, on which teachers' livelihood, as noted above, is perceived to be at stake.

Dr. David Murray's commitment to include music in the academic curriculum was visionary, creative, and deeply collaborative. He worked with academic teachers closely to identify big ideas, listening carefully, making suggestions based on what he perceived was important to others as well as his own commitments, offering support on conceptual and technical levels. In addition to teaching the

¹ This was particularly glaring in one of the high schools in that had the most successful and exciting arts education program I have ever seen. This school, in Washington State, integrated the arts into every imaginable subject – from physics and math to French and Chinese. The only teachers who were not involved in the whole school endeavor were the music specialists. Involving teachers of music performance in arts integration is extremely difficult, as other studies have shown. This is true for ordinary, as well as exemplary schools (Bresler, 2003).

classes twice a week during the units that incorporated music, Murray was available to help in many ways (e.g., leaving CD's and any other musical material available for the classroom teacher; consulting with suggestions on musical materials). In some cases, the classroom teachers reported bringing in their own examples of music for discussion in relation to the thematic unit. However, in the main they relied on David to provide the lesson content and listening material for the curricular units.

Teachers' Incentives, Rewards, and Transformations

Why did teachers volunteer to participate in such a time consuming effort? Teachers felt strongly that an integrated curriculum will promote students' learning. Several said that the arts will help make learning more relevant for the students. Others suggested that the arts allowed them to teach to their students' strengths. The principal said she thought the Martinez students had a knack for dance, storytelling, music, and theatrics that was part of their custom and "a way of life." For another teacher, the integration of academic content and the arts helped make what they learned significant to the students.

As manifested in the cases of many teachers, collaborations proved to be transformative on different levels. The most obvious was a change of roles for participating teachers in all sites – a heightened movement toward *developing*, rather than just implementing, curricula. In developing integrated curricula, music teachers moved away from their ready-made lesson plans, art teachers, from reliance on set activities and skills, and academic teachers moved away from reliance on textbooks, towards a focus on larger projects, overarching themes, broad issues and questions. In this process, they also started to draw upon a larger array of resources. On a more fundamental level, they learned to listen to each other in ways that expanded their own vision of their discipline.

Change of self-image. Often, teachers brought up in our conversations the gradual but fundamental changes in their images of teaching that were triggered as part of the process of these collaborative relationship. From a framework of an isolated teacher teaching individual classes, teachers commented that they now saw themselves as a part of a larger whole. Teachers said they became conscious of how their curriculum fit and affected other disciplines, and the ways from which they were able to draw upon other disciplines. This was manifested even at the level of selecting and purchasing materials, with teachers looking for materials of interest to others.

Becoming central to the school. Invariably, arts teachers became more central to the school and its mission. In elementary schools, specialists represent a distinctive subculture within schools, where theirs is frequently the only subject that is not taught by classroom teachers. Hence, their position, typically a marginalized one, is as "the other" teacher. That marginalization often occurs in secondary schools as well. The ability to work together towards common goals facilitated the positive negotiation with classroom teachers, creating allies among different faculty members. Integration placed music and art teachers as not only legitimate, highly-valued citizens of the school, part of its core community of practice, but as leaders.

Integration as an Instance of Educational Entrepreneurship

Reflecting back on what made this case successful, it is the commitment and characteristics of the key people involved in the project. These characteristics match, in many ways, those of social

entrepreneurs. I suggest the term *educational entrepreneur* (EE) to indicate a person that exhibits entrepreneurial qualities in the context of schooling. Clearly, educational entrepreneurship can be manifested in various ways: integration is only one of these. However, I believe that in a genuine integration that is committed to re-conceptualize, beyond surface techniques, educational entrepreneurship is vital. While not all teachers are drawn to arts integration, and not all schools lend themselves to integration, educational entrepreneurship offers a broader perspective that has to do with teaching according to one's deepest values, the wish to make an impact, and, possibly, self-actualization. Going more deeply than integration, I believe that entrepreneurial qualities can expand the roles of music teachers, enhancing their satisfaction, ownership and impact.

Educational Entrepreneurship and its Root in Social Entrepreneurship

The concept of entrepreneurship has long been associated with business and finance. In the past few years that concept has been broadened. One use came out a couple of years ago in a widely acclaimed PBS documentary on social entrepreneurship with the evocative title of "The New Heroes". The documentary featured people like Sri Lankan Nobel Prize laureate Muhammad Yunus and the Grameen Bank, his micro-financing project with women as major clients. The series consisted of 13 other social entrepreneurs all over the world featuring women and men with extraordinary projects of social service and impact. These projects were founded on innovative ideas as well as tremendous persistence, and the ability to work with various groups of people, negotiate, and persuade to carry these projects to fruition. School teachers loom large in these endeavors.

Examining the cases of social entrepreneurship more closely, they all involved what I regard as education in its deepest sense. In Yunus' case, the education encompassed the whole traditional Sri Lankan culture who learned that women could be highly capable and responsible business people, and that poor people, in general, showed exemplary trustworthiness. Within formal schools, classroom teacher and musician Rafe Esquith (2004) exemplifies many of these qualities in his teaching, reaching students in powerful and impressive ways.

Reflecting back of my various studies of arts integration (e.g., Bresler, 1997; Bresler, 2003), I realized that where they were successful, they entailed an entrepreneurial style and qualities². One of the things that entrepreneurs, in economic, social, and educational domains must do, is to develop the projects, to make sure that the "product" interacts with people's experiences to bring about change. (This is different from the traditional roles of university faculty. Faculty are expected to publish papers but are not responsible for their impact. They are expected to teach, but the onus on learning is typically on students.) Educational entrepreneurs embody the commitment to usefulness and impact in their teaching.

Qualities shared by entrepreneurs and entrepreneurial teachers include: (i) vision, and creativity in exploring, identifying and creating educational opportunities; (ii) ability to listen to others, teachers and students, to construct a shared, relevant mission, and to collaborate and team-lead a project; and (iii) persistence in a process of experiential learning within their classroom settings and from interactions with colleagues.

² A recent study by my doctoral student, Su-Jeong Wee, who studied drama integration in a promising setting, highlights the problems when the teachers are not entrepreneurial (Wee, 2009; in press),

Academic learning is often theoretical and text-based. In contrast, entrepreneurship involves experiential learning that includes taking risks and learning from mistakes. One major risk is the giving up of the safety of the disciplines and prescribed materials, to cross-disciplinary borders and re-consider what is important. Indeed, the sense of exploration manifested by Dr. Murray and his colleagues in crossing disciplines is highly entrepreneurial in its focus on issues rather than traditional ways of organizing knowledge (e.g., Solomon, Marshal, & Gardner, 2005), undertaking work that goes beyond conventional, well-established understanding of knowledge.

The Context of Schooling: Two Dialectical Forces

Within the contemporary scene of schooling, there are two dialectical forces that affect educational entrepreneurship: accountability and subjectivity. Accountability, part of a knowledge-society in a globalized information age, entails strong expectations for standardized test-scores, stressing uniformity of outcomes. Accountability raises the risky-ness of creativity and aiming for relevance and personal meaning. This push for accountability is happening not just in the U.S. but also in European and Asian countries.

If accountability is associated with the economy and the business world, subjectivity, the second force, originated in educational ideology and scholarship. With its roots in progressive education, subjectivity has been central to the post-modern turn, which assumes that social reality in general, and learning in particular, is constructed and created (and therefore involves multiple realities) rather than objective (and therefore a single reality). It is theories of constructivism applied to the profession of teaching, I believe, that posit that “we teach who we are” (Palmer, 1988), stressing ownership and personal visions. In education, it favors “show” (by action) rather than merely “tell” (by words), reminding us that teaching is not a technical profession but is rather one that is imbued with values, personal commitments, and modeling.

“Teaching who we are” means that teachers share important traits with artists and musicians. In my own work (e.g., Bresler, 2005, 2006, 2008a) I have examined the ways in which music provide rich and powerful models for perception, conceptualization, and engagement for both makers and viewers. I have been interested in the potential of the arts to cultivate habits of mind that are directly relevant to the processes and products of research. The same principles, I believe, apply to teaching. The change of teachers’ role from implementers to creators of curriculum, with an emphasis on interpretation and going beyond what exists, makes them educational, intellectual entrepreneurs. The context of schooling offers a unique environment for entrepreneurship, or its sister-term, intrapreneurship, to indicate work within institutions.

Experiential Learning, and Taking Risks

Entrepreneurs in all domains – business, social, intellectual, and educational -- learn experientially. Experiential learning theory is based on the demonstrated value of active, personal, and direct experiences in contrast to vicarious experience of watching others or reading about it (Kolb, 1984). The literature on experiential learning has focused on articulating the process of moving dialectically between the modes of action and reflection (Schon, 1983). This interplay of doing and

thinking allows educators, scientists, artists, and business people, among others, to interpret the outcome of their decisions and actions and make changes.

An important part of experiential learning is the learning from mistakes. The understanding of failure as contributing to learning is increasingly recognized in the scholarly literature in various intellectual disciplines, from Engineering and Sciences to Design and Education (e.g. Cardon & McGrath, 1999; McGrath, 1999; Petroski, 1992, 1996; Politis & Gabrielsson, 2007; Thornhill & Amit, 2003; Vesper, 1980). As part of experiential learning, the act of failing can be confronted, studied and dealt with in a systematic and productive way (Cannon & Edmondson, 2005). Discussing the context of entrepreneurship, Spinosa et al. (1997) suggest that human beings, become competent not by abstracting theories but by doing, failing, (and I would add, analyzing and modifying), then doing again until they become sensitized in their habits to what is worthwhile and consider what is not. Since the question is not whether a failure will occur, but rather *when*, experienced entrepreneurs have developed a higher acceptance of failures (and thus risk) as a way of increasing variety and expanding the search for opportunities (Politis & Gabrielsson, 2007).

All the teachers interviewed and the project coordinator referred to the stress they felt as they implemented a new curriculum, experienced accelerated block scheduling, team taught with each other for the first time, and integrated fine arts on a regular basis. This was a large, and in many ways brave undertaking, and they were all expressing some signs of ‘wear and tear’ in addition to the regular stresses of teaching high school. They were also experiencing administrative and scheduling glitches, unexpected personnel changes and other short term problems typical of any new undertaking in a large high school. However, most of these seemed to be remedied in the second semester.

A major issue was the tests. Tighter accountability means that more teachers in more schools are teaching to the tests, even though they realize that their curriculum becomes narrower and that students’ learning is compromised. It took great courage to be able to resist the tests. Indeed, teachers’ and principal’s faith in meaningful education proved worthwhile as test-scores improved dramatically. But the risk is real. The ability to examine, reflect and self-correct in teaching a less-traveled road, and to reach students in the way that the integrated curriculum did proved to be its own reward. Still, the higher test-scores allowed the project to continue.

Collaboration: Establishing Transformative Practice Zones

The most time-consuming part is the collaboration with other teachers in an effort that goes beyond one’s classroom. Given that teaching is a lone profession, for those committed to work with others, *how* do we find ways of interacting and working together across disciplines, professions, and ideologies? Successful cases of arts integration, I found are characterized by what I call “transformative practice zones” (Bresler, 2003) that facilitate working together. Transformative practice zones provide spaces to share and listen to others’ ideas, visions and commitments, and to build relationship in collaboration across disciplines and institutions.

Originally, Judy Davidson Wasser and I constructed the concept of the “interpretive zone” in the context of a research project as the intellectual realm in which *researchers* work collaboratively (Bresler, Wasser, Hertzog, & Lemons, 1996). The term “zone”, too, is borrowed from usage in other disciplines – Vygotsky’s “zone of proximal development” (1986), and Bakhtin’s “character zones” (1986). Non-

academic uses include “comfort zone”, “speeding zone,” “demilitarized zone,” and “inter-tidal zone.” What is similar about these notions of zones, resonating with our conception of it, is that they refer to unsettled locations, areas of overlap or contestation. It is in a zone that unexpected forces meet, new challenges arise, and solutions have to be devised with the resources at hand. The notion of zone implies dynamic processes—exchange, transaction, transformation, and intensity.

Like Bakhtin (1986), we recognized zones to be socially and historically situated, in which multiple voices converge and diverge through the tensions imposed by centripetal and centrifugal forces in action. Transformative practice zones are different from the typical team-planning, where people are delegated responsibilities and the task is being divided. TPZ are spaces as well as a way of interacting and thinking, where the participants are touched and often transformed in the process. The sum – a gestalt -- is bigger than its parts.

Interpretive zones center on interpretation and meaning making. When it comes to *working together* across disciplines (involving action, such as developing integrated curriculum), the target is improved *practice*. The term “zone” assumes more than one party, negotiating, competing, and interacting from different perspectives. Thus, it moves us away from the traditional role of the teacher as lone, isolated figure working independently in the classroom, to one that is socially embedded, shaping and being reshaped. The concept of polyphony of voices is central. In the transformative practice zone, participants bring together their various areas of knowledge, experiences, and beliefs to forge new curricula and explore teaching styles through the process of the joint thinking and action in which they are engaged. This allows people who were trained and enculturated in one discipline to learn from people in other disciplines.

Care is the foundation on which transformational practice zones exist. Within a group, monitoring one's subjectivity is necessary so that the group can function with some degree of harmony. Individual needs for space, dominance, and acknowledgment shape group processes. In our research group, we found it important to discuss these issues in order to understand our collective subjectivity, identifying, rather than avoiding points of tension, negotiating differences, and dealing with conflicts (Bresler, Wasser, Hertzog, & Lemons, 1996). Our discussions were not always harmonious. Because our interpretations often led us to examine values, our professional and personal commitments involved emotional responses and tension. In that research context, for example, we debated public education versus private, religious education; the role of excellence versus general education; and the usefulness of integration of arts disciplines with the general curriculum. Not all issues were resolved, nor did we feel they could or should be. While we were able, through discussion, to reach a deeper understanding of our diverse positions, in many cases we continued to hold divergent views. Here, consensus was not always a goal. Instead, in that collaborative work, we aimed at understandings of arts instruction that were more complex, pulling from a relative simplistic advocacy toward a portrayal of multiple perspectives.

Music educators' experience and understandings of musical ensembles can serve as powerful models for working together. Various types of music ensembles with their distinct characteristics provide useful exemplars for the individual/group relationship. The big orchestra and the choir are two models where the individual voice is required to fit with a pre-ordained conception of the larger whole. More compatible with the notion of TZP is the chamber group model where each member has its distinct musical line and color, where the individual parts are always prominent, never lost in the whole composition.

Mandating and prescribing collaborations, (let alone transformations...) is guaranteed to ruin the whole endeavor. Listening and respecting the process is crucial. Rather than prescribed outcomes, it is

useful to think of starting points, conditions that are favorable to productive zones, serving as enablers. These include structures for meetings where trust could be built and nurtured. It is helpful to have supportive administrators conveying interest in teachers' ideas and encouragement to try these ideas. What made the Martinez and the other four schools committed to arts integration successful was the creation of dynamic transformative practice zones where teachers could share ideas, reconsider visions and goals, work with others to create new ones. The Getty schools were selected on the basis of their commitment to create structures and spaces for teachers to meet, discuss, plan, and reflect. These structures, sometimes weekly or bi-weekly, generated frequent, informal conversations, which served to promote the development of shared goals that ultimately resulted in a shared vision. Arts integration in all settings thrived when these collaborative structures were in place, and was far less effective in their absence.

Educational Entrepreneurship as a Mutual Shaping Endeavor

I started the paper with Parker Palmer's (1998) famous adage that "We teach who we are," making a case that teachers' inner landscapes are central to what they do. I have noted elsewhere (Bresler, 2008b), that other occupations, to various extents, are shaped by those who "occupy" them. Indeed, one can distinguish occupations by the degree to which they offer opportunities to express one. Being a musician, as well as a teacher, are two obvious examples of occupations that allow ample space to express who one are. As importantly, who one is is shaped by their (teaching, musical, and other) experiences. I believe that educational entrepreneurs, like artists and musicians, pattern themselves after their visions, thus giving form to their spirit in the process. In this paper I suggest that educational entrepreneurship allows teachers to manifest who we are, and in turn, be shaped by this experience. As importantly, in the examples outlined above, the integrated arts curriculum invited students, too, to "learn who they are", making schooling a space of relevance and meaningful knowledge.

Aknowlegments

I am indebted to Smaragda Chrysostomou, and Nurit Cohen-Evron for reading this manuscript and for their insightful comments.

References

- Bresler, L. (1997a). General issues across sites: The role of the arts in unifying high school curriculum. A report for the College Board/Getty Center for the Arts.
- Bresler, L. (1997b). *Arts integration in the Texas site*. A report for the College Board/Getty Center for the Arts.
- Bresler, L. (2003). Out of the trenches: The joys (and risks) of cross-disciplinary collaborations. *Council of Research in Music Education*, 152, 17-39.
- Bresler, L. (2005). What musicianship can teach educational research. *Music Education Research*, 7(2), 169-183.
- Bresler, L. (2006). Embodied Narrative Inquiry: A Methodology of Connection. *Research Studies in Music Education*, 27, 21-43.
- Bresler, L. (2008a). The Music Lesson. In J. G. Knowles, & A. Cole (Eds.), *Handbook of thew Arts in Qualitative Inquiry: Perspectives, Methodologies, Examples, and Issues* (pp. 225-237). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

- Bresler, L. (2008b). Research as experience and experience as research: Mutual shaping in the arts and in qualitative inquiry. *LEARNing Landscapes, 1*(3), 123-132.
- Bresler, L, Wasser, J., Hertzog N., & Lemons ,M. (1996). Beyond the lone ranger researcher: Teamwork in qualitative research. *Research Studies in Music Education, 7*, 15-30.
- Cannon, M. D., & Edmondson, A. C. (2005). Failing to learn and learning to fail (intelligently): How great organizations put failure to work and innovate and improve. *Long Range Planning, 38*, 299-319.
- Cardon, M. S., & McGrath, R. G. (1999). When the going gets tough: Towards psychology of entrepreneurial failure and re-motivation. In P. Reynolds et al (Ed.), *Frontiers of Entrepreneurship Research* (pp. 58-72). Wellesley, MA: Babson College.
- Esquith, R. (2004) *There Are No Shortcuts*. London: Penguin.
- Kolb, D. A. (1984). *Experiential learning: experience as the source of learning and development*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- McGrath, R., G. (1999). Falling forward: Real options reasoning and entrepreneurial failure. *Academy of Management Review, 24*(1), 13-20.
- Palmer, P. (1998). *The courage to teach: Exploring the inner landscape of a teacher's life*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Productions.
- Petroski, H. (1992). *To Engineer is human: The role of failure in successful design*. New York: Vintage Books.
- Petroski, H. (1996). *Invention by design: How engineers get from thought to thing*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- Politis, D., & Gabrielsson, J. (2007). Entrepreneurs' attitudes towards failures -- An experiential learning approach. Babson College Entrepreneurship Research Conference (BCERC 2007). Retrieved from <http://ssrn.com/abstract=1064982> on January 25, 2008.
- Schon, D. A. (1983). *The Reflective practitioner: How professionals think in action*. New York: Basic Books.
- Solomon, J. L., Marshal, P., & Gardner, H. (2005). Crossing boundaries to generative wisdom: An analysis of professional work. In R. Sternberg & J. Jordan (Eds.), *A Handbook of Wisdom* (pp. 272-296). New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Spinosa, C., Flores, F., & Dreyfus, H. (1997). *Entrepreneurship, democratic action, and the cultivation of solidarity: Disclosing new worlds*. Cambridge: MIT Press.
- Thornhill, S., & Amit, R. (2003). Learning about failure: Bankruptcy, firm age and the resource-based view. *Organizational Science, 14*(5), 497-509.
- Vesper, K. H. (1980). *New venture strategies*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- Wee, S. (2009). *Drama education curriculum by drama specialist in early childhood education*. Unpublished dissertation. University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign.
- Wee, S. (in press). Dramas of Collaboration between a Drama Specialist and Early Childhood Classroom Teachers. *Early Childhood Education Journal*.

LIORA BRESLER

UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS, URBANA, USA

Liora Bresler is a Professor at the College of Education, College of Fine and Applied Arts (School of Art and Design and School of Music), and Fellow at the Academy of Entrepreneurial Leadership at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign. She holds BA's in Piano Performance and Philosophy, and an MA in Musicology, from Tel-Aviv University; and an M.A and Ph.D. in Education from Stanford University.

Bresler is a Distinguished Fellow in NAEA (2010). Recent honors include the Edwin Ziegfeld Award for distinguished international leadership in art education by the United States Society for Education Through Art (2007), and the Lin Wright Special Recognition Award to Theater Education by the American Alliance for Theatre and Education (2007). For teaching, she has won the Distinguished Teaching Life-Long Career Award at the College of Education (2004), and the Campus Award for Excellence in Graduate and Professional Training at the University of Illinois (2005). Bresler serves as an editor for the book series: Landscapes: Aesthetics, Arts and Education, for Springer. She was the co-founder (with Tom Barone, 1999-) of the International Journal for Arts and Education. Bresler has written over 100 book chapters and papers in leading journals of arts and education including the Educational Researcher, Studies in Art Education, and Music Education Research. In addition to her work in curriculum in arts education, and qualitative research methodology (including arts-based inquiry, recent research interests include Performing Arts Centers as Experiential Learning; and Educational Entrepreneurship in Academe and schooling. Recent publications include the International Handbook of Research in Arts Education (2007, Springer), Knowing bodies, moving minds: Towards embodied teaching and learning (2004, Kluwer), The arts in children's lives: Context, culture, and curriculum (Bresler and Thompson, 2002, Kluwer) and International Research in Education (Bresler and Ardichvili, 2002 by Peter Lang). Her work has been translated to German, French, Portuguese, Hebrew, and Spanish. Bresler has been invited to give keynote speeches on six continents, and has given invited talks, seminars and short courses in thirty-some countries spanning Europe, Asia, Africa, North and South America, and Australia. In addition to her position at Illinois, Bresler is a professor II (visiting) in Stord University, Norway, and an Honorary Professor at the Hong Kong Institute of Education. Most recently, she has served as a visiting professor at Stockholm University, and an advisory professor at the Hong Kong Institute of Education.